

# Stochastic optimal control

## Recap

Ito process Let  $b: [0, \infty) \times \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  be measurable and adapted [i.e.  $b(t, \cdot)$  is  $\mathcal{F}_t$  mble  $\forall t \geq 0$ ]  
 Let  $\sigma: [0, \infty) \times \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$  be progressively measurable [i.e.  $\sigma|_{[0,t] \times \Omega}$  is  $\mathcal{B}[0,t] \times \mathcal{F}_t$  mble  $\forall t \geq 0$ ].

Suppose  $\mathbb{P}(\int_0^t \sum_{i,j} \sigma_{ij}^2(s) + |b(s)| ds < \infty \forall t \geq 0) = 1$

Let  $B$  be a  $m$ -dimensional Brownian motion and  $X \in \mathbb{R}^n$

$$X_t = X + \int_0^t b(s) ds + \int_0^t \sigma(s) dB_s$$

is called Ito process.

Ito diffusion Let  $b: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n, \sigma: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$  such that

$$\|b(x) - b(y)\| + \left( \sum_{i,j} |\sigma_{ij}(x) - \sigma_{ij}(y)|^2 \right)^{1/2} \leq D \|x - y\|$$

$\forall x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and some  $D > 0$ . Let  $s \geq 0, x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ .

Then 
$$X_t = x + \int_s^t b(X_r) dr + \int_s^t \sigma(X_r) dB_r, t \geq s,$$

is called Ito diffusion.

A solution to this equation is unique up to indistinguishability, i.e. two solutions  $X$  and  $\hat{X}$  satisfy

$$\mathbb{P}_{x,s}(X_t = \hat{X}_t \forall t \in [s, \infty)) = 1.$$

Moreover,  $X$  is adapted to  $(\mathcal{F}_t^B)_{t \geq 0}$ .

The uniqueness implies two important properties of Ito diffusions

1. Time homogeneous

$$\begin{aligned} X_{s+t} &= x + \int_s^{s+t} b(X_r) dr + \int_s^{s+t} \sigma(X_r) dB_r \\ &= x + \int_0^t b(X_{r+s}) dr + \int_0^t \sigma(X_{s+r}) d(B_{r+s} - B_s) \end{aligned}$$

$\Rightarrow$  uniqueness  $(X_{s+t} : t \geq 0; \mathbb{P}_{x,s}) = (X_t : t \geq 0; \mathbb{P}_{x,0})$

2. Markov property

Let  $\phi: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be mble and bounded,  $J$  a  $(\mathcal{F}_t^B)_t$  stopping time,  $s \geq 0, x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $\mathbb{P}_{x,s}(J < \infty) = 1$ .

②

Then  $\mathbb{E}_{x,s}[\Phi(X_{T+h}) | \mathcal{F}_T^B] = \mathbb{E}_{x,0}[\Phi(X_h)] \quad \forall h \geq 0$   
 $\mathbb{P}_{x,s} - \text{a.s.}$

Proof idea in case  $T = t \geq 0$  constant.

$$X_{t+h} = X_t + \int_t^{t+h} b(X_r) dr + \int_t^{t+h} \sigma(X_r) d(B_r - B_t)$$

The solution to this eq is unique and mble w.r.t  $\sigma(B_r - B_t; r \geq t)$  which is independent of  $\mathcal{F}_t^B$

$$\Rightarrow \mathbb{E}_{x,s}[\Phi(X_{t+h}) | \mathcal{F}_t^B] = \mathbb{E}_{x,t}[\Phi(X_{t+h})]$$

$$= \text{homogeneous} \quad \mathbb{E}_{x,0}[\Phi(X_h)]$$

We denote  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}^n, \Phi \in C^2(\mathbb{R}^n)$

$$L\Phi(x) = \sum_{i=1}^n b_i(x) \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial x_i}(x) + \sum_{i,j=1}^n \frac{1}{2} (\sigma \sigma^T(x))_{ij} \frac{\partial^2 \Phi}{\partial x_i \partial x_j}(x)$$

the generalized generator of  $X$ .

By Itô's formula,

$$\mathbb{E}_{x,0}[\Phi(X_T)] = \Phi(x) + \mathbb{E}_{x,0}\left[\int_0^T L\Phi(X_s) ds\right] \quad \boxed{\text{Dynkin's formula}}$$

for all  $\Phi \in C^2$  and  $\mathcal{F}_t^B$ -stopping times  $T$  for which

$$\mathbb{E}_{x,0}\left[\int_0^T \sigma_{ij}(X_s) \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial x_i}(X_s) dB_j\right] = 0 \quad \forall i,j.$$

Examples

~~$T$  is the exit time~~

$\Phi \in C^2(\mathbb{R}^2), \mathbb{E}_{x,0}[T] < \infty$  (see last week)

$\Phi \in C^2(\mathbb{R}^2)$  and  $T$  exit time of a bounded domain  $\mathbb{E}_{x,0}[T] < \infty$ .  
 the continuity of  $\sigma_{ij}$  and  $\frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial x_i}$  and the dominated convergence theorem.

### Problem statement - Stochastic Control

Let  $U \subseteq \mathbb{R}^k$  be a measurable set  
 $b: \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^n \times U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n, \sigma: \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^n \times U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$  measurable functions and  $B$  a  $m$ -dimensional Brownian motion.

Suppose there is an  $U$ -valued,  $(\mathcal{F}_t^B)_t$  adapted process  $(u_t)_{t \geq 0}$  and a  $\mathbb{R}^n$ -valued Itô process such that

$$X_t = x + \int_s^t b(r, X_r, u_r) dr + \int_s^t \sigma(r, X_r, u_r) dB_r \quad \forall t \geq s$$



There are more assumptions needed to make the terms well-defined / guaranteed existence but we will state the problem under the simple assumption that the process exists.

Let  $f: \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^n \times U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ ,  $g: \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be continuous functions and  $G \subseteq \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^n$  be a ~~bounded~~ domain.

$\hat{T}_G = \inf \{ t > s \mid (t, X_t) \notin G \}$  the first exit time from  $G$ .

Suppose

(1.4)  $E_{x,s} \left[ \int_s^{\hat{T}_G} |f(r, X_r, u_r)| dr + |g(\hat{T}_G, X_{\hat{T}_G})| \mathbb{1}_{\hat{T}_G < \infty} \right] < \infty$   
 $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}^n, s \geq 0$ .

We define

control  $\vec{u}$   
 $J^{\vec{u}}(x, s) = E_{x,s} \left[ \int_s^{\hat{T}_G} f(r, X_r, u_r) dr + g(\hat{T}_G, X_{\hat{T}_G}) \mathbb{1}_{\hat{T}_G < \infty} \right]$   
 ↑ performance fun      ↑ profit rate function      ↑ bequest function = inheritance

i.e. accrued interest + final returns if we sell

Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a family of allowed controls, i.e.

- $X$  exists
- $u$  adapted and  $U$  valued
- (1.4) holds

For all  $y \in G$  we are looking for  $u^* = u^{*y} \in \mathcal{A}$  such that

$\Phi(y) := \sup_{u \in \mathcal{A}} J^u(y) = J^{u^*}(y)$  ← optimal control.  
 ↑ optimal performance function or value function.      ↑ admissible controls

Before we look at ways to solve these problems, we try to "remove" the time dependence from coefficients  $b$  and  $\sigma$  to get closer to the setup of Ito diffusions where we have many results already.

Write  $Y_t = \begin{pmatrix} s+t \\ X_{s+t} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} s \\ x \end{pmatrix}$

Note that

$Y_t := \begin{pmatrix} s+t \\ X_{s+t} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} s \\ x \end{pmatrix} + \int_s^{s+t} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ b(r, X_r, u_r) \end{pmatrix} dr + \int_s^{s+t} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \dots 0 \\ \sigma(r, X_r, u_r) \end{pmatrix} dB_r$   
 $= \begin{pmatrix} s \\ x \end{pmatrix} + \int_0^t \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ b(Y_r, \tilde{u}_r) \end{pmatrix} dr + \int_0^t \begin{pmatrix} 0 \dots 0 \\ \sigma(Y_r, \tilde{u}_r) \end{pmatrix} d(B_{r+s} - B_s)$   
 with  $\tilde{u}_r = u_{r+s}$

④

$\Rightarrow y$  solves an equation with a different BM but non-time dependent coefficients

For the optimal control problem we obtain

$$\hat{J}_G - s = \inf\{t > s \mid (t, X_t) \notin G\} - s$$

$$= \inf\{t > 0 \mid (s+t, Y_t) \notin G\} =: \tilde{J}_G$$

$$\Rightarrow J^u(x, s) = \mathbb{E}_{x, s} \left[ \int_s^{\hat{J}_G} p(r, X_r, u_r) dr + g(\hat{J}_G, X_{\hat{J}_G}) \mathbb{1}_{\hat{J}_G < \infty} \right]$$

$$= \mathbb{E}_{x, s} \left[ \int_0^{\hat{J}_G - s} p(y_r, u_{r+s}) dr + g(\hat{J}_G - s + s, X_{\hat{J}_G - s + s}) \mathbb{1}_{\hat{J}_G < \infty} \right]$$

$$= \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^{J_G} p(y_r, \tilde{u}_r) dr + g(y_{J_G}) \mathbb{1}_{J_G < \infty} \right]$$

$y = \begin{pmatrix} x \\ s \end{pmatrix}$

Markov controls: ~~The~~ Today's lecture is mainly looking at Markov controls.

Suppose  $u: \mathbb{R}^{n+1} \rightarrow U$  is a function with  $u_t = u(t, X_t)$ .  
Then  $\tilde{u}_t = u_{s+t} = u(y_t)$ .

$u$  is called Markov control if  $y \mapsto b(y, u(y))$  and  $y \mapsto \sigma(y, u(y))$  are Lipschitz continuous on  $\mathbb{R}^{n+1}$  and (1.4) holds. The generalized generator is [use  $b_t = 1, \sigma_{ij} = 0$ ]  
 $L^u \Phi(y) = \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial s}(y) + \sum_{i=1}^n b_i(y, u(y)) \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial x_i} + \sum_{i,j=1}^n a_{ij}(y, u(y)) \frac{\partial^2 \Phi}{\partial x_i \partial x_j}(y) \quad \forall \Phi \in C^2, \alpha = \frac{1}{2} \alpha \alpha^T$

Thm The Hamilton-Jacobi-Bellman (HJB) equation (E)

Let  $\mathcal{A} = \{u : u \text{ Markov control}\}$ .

Suppose  $\Phi \in C^2(G) \cap C(\bar{G})$  satisfies

$$\mathbb{E}_y \left[ |\Phi(y_0)| + \int_0^\alpha |L^v \Phi(y_t)| dt \right] < \infty$$

Interpret  $v$  in  $L^v$  as a constant function

for all bounded stopping times  $\alpha \leq J_G, y \in G, v \in U$ .

Moreover, suppose that an optimal Markov control  $u^*$  exists and that  $\partial G$  is regular for  $(Y_t^{u^*})_{t \geq 0}$ .

$$\text{Then } \sup_{v \in U} \left\{ \cancel{p(y, v)} + L^v \Phi(y) \right\} = 0 \quad \forall y \in G$$

$$\Phi(y) = g(y) \quad \forall y \in \partial G$$

$$\text{and } p(y, u^*(y)) + (L^{u^*} \Phi)(y) = 0 \quad \forall y \in G.$$

Note: Regular means

$$\mathbb{P}_y^{u^*} [J_G = 0] = 1 \quad \forall y \in \partial G.$$



Proof

Let  $\alpha \leq T_G$  be a bounded stopping time and  $u \in \mathcal{A}$  a Markov control.

Then

$$\mathbb{E}_y [J^u(Y_\alpha)] \stackrel{\text{Def}}{=} \mathbb{E}_y [ \mathbb{E}_{Y_\alpha} [ \int_0^{T_G} f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr + g(Y_{T_G}) \mathbb{1}_{T_G < \infty} ] ]$$

$$\stackrel{\text{Strong Markov}}{=} \mathbb{E}_y [ \mathbb{E}_y [ \int_0^{T_G - \alpha} f(Y_{r+\alpha}, u(Y_{r+\alpha})) dr + g(Y_{T_G}) \mathbb{1}_{T_G < \infty} ] ]$$

time shift by  $\alpha \Rightarrow T_G \rightsquigarrow T_G - \alpha, Y_r \rightsquigarrow Y_{r+\alpha}$

$$\stackrel{\text{Tower}}{=} \mathbb{E}_y [ \int_0^{T_G} f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr + g(Y_{T_G}) \mathbb{1}_{T_G < \infty} ] = \int_0^\alpha f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr$$

$$= J^u(y) - \mathbb{E}_y [ \int_0^\alpha f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr ]$$

$$\Rightarrow J^u(y) = \mathbb{E}_y [ \int_0^\alpha f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr ] + \mathbb{E}_y [ J^u(Y_\alpha) ] \quad (2.6)$$

Dynamic programming principle

Note that we needed only that  $u$  is a Markov control and none of the other assumptions.

Let  $W = \{ (r, z) \in G : r < t_1 \}$  for a fixed  $s < t_1 < \infty$



Note that  $Y_t$  always moves to the right because it's first component is  $s+t$ .

Let  $\alpha = \inf \{ t \geq 0 : Y_t \notin W \} \leq t_1 - s$

$$\text{Let } u(r, z) = \begin{cases} v & \text{if } (r, z) \in W \\ u^*(r, z) & \text{if } (r, z) \in G \setminus W \end{cases}$$

where  $v \in U$  is arbitrary. Then

$$\Phi(Y_\alpha) \stackrel{u^* \text{ optimal}}{=} J^{u^*}(Y_\alpha) \stackrel{J^{u^*}(Y_\alpha) \text{ depends only on } u \text{ outside } W}{=} J^u(Y_\alpha)$$

$$\Rightarrow \Phi(y) \geq J^u(y) = \mathbb{E}_y [ \int_0^\alpha f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr ] + \mathbb{E}_y [ \Phi(Y_\alpha) ] \quad (2.6)$$

Since  $\Phi \in C^2$  Dynkin's formula gives

$$\mathbb{E}_y [ \Phi(Y_\alpha) ] = \Phi(y) + \mathbb{E}_y [ \int_0^\alpha (L^u \Phi)(Y_r) dr ]$$

We want to use this but conditions are not satisfied. Approximate by bounded set and convergence

use dominated convergence

⑥

$$\Rightarrow \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^\alpha f(Y_r, v) + (L^v \Phi)(Y_r) dr \right] \leq 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{1}{\mathbb{E}_y[\alpha]} \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^\alpha f(Y_r, v) + (L^v \Phi)(Y_r) dr \right] \leq 0 \quad \forall t_1 > s$$

Taking  $t_1 \downarrow s$  the continuity of the involved functions yields

$$f(y, v) + (L^v \Phi)(y) \leq 0 \quad \forall y \in G, v \in U$$

It remains to show the boundary condition and that the supremum is attained.

For the boundary condition:

Since  $u^*$  is optimal, we have

$$\Phi(y) = J^{u^*}(y) = \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^{T_G} f(Y_s, u^*(Y_s)) ds + g(Y_{T_G}) \mathbb{1}_{T_G < \infty} \right]$$

~~If  $y \in \partial G$~~  If  $y \in \partial G$ , then  $\mathbb{P}_y(T_G = 0) = 1$  (since  $\partial G$  is regular) and therefore

$$\Phi(y) = 0 + g(y) \quad \checkmark$$

The identity  $L^{u^*} \Phi(y) = -f(y, u^*(y)) \quad \forall y \in G$

says that  $\Phi$  solves the Dirichlet-Poisson problem.

Maybe I say sth about it in the end. It is not too hard to show that any solution is of this form but that  $\Phi$  really solves it is a big theorem.

□

~~Thm The HJB(II) equation.~~

Interpretation of HJB(I): When an optimal control exists and everything is nice, then its value at point  $y$  is the maximizer of

$$v \mapsto f(y, v) + (L^v \Phi)(y)$$

$\Rightarrow$  can solve real valued optimization problem instead of stochastic control problem.

But we know only that being the maximizer is necessary. Is it also sufficient?



Thm The HJB(II) equation

Let  $\Phi \in C^2(G) \cap C(\bar{G})$  such that  $\forall v \in U$

$$f(y, v) + (L^v \Phi)(y) \leq 0 \quad \forall y \in G \text{ and}$$

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow T_0} \Phi(Y_t) = g(Y_{T_0}) \mathbb{1}_{T_0 < \infty} \quad \mathbb{P}_y - a.s.$$

$\{ \Phi(Y_J) : J \text{ stopping time } J \leq T_0 \}$  uniformly  $\mathbb{P}_y$  integrable for all Markov controls  $u$  and  $y \in G$ .

Then  $\Phi(y) \geq J^u(y) \quad \forall$  Markov controls  $u$  and all  $y \in G$ .

Moreover, if  $\forall y \in G \exists u_0(y)$  such that

$$f(y, u_0(y)) + L^{u_0(y)} \Phi(y) = 0$$

and  $\{ \Phi(Y_J) : J \text{ stopping time } J \leq T_0 \}$  uniformly  $\mathbb{P}_y$  integrable  $\forall u \in U, y \in G$  and if  $u_0$  is admissible, ~~then~~

then  ~~$u$  is a Markov control such that  $\Phi(y) = J^u(y)$~~   
and if  ~~$u_0$  is admissible,  $\Phi(y) = \bar{\Phi}(y)$~~ .

Proof Let  $u$  be a Markov control and set

$$T_R = \min \{ R, T_0, \inf \{ t > 0 : |Y_t| \geq R \} \} \quad \forall R < \infty.$$

By Dynkin's formula

$$\mathbb{E}_y[\Phi(Y_{T_R})] = \Phi(y) + \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^{T_R} (L^u \Phi)(Y_r) dr \right]$$

$$\leq \Phi(y) - \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^{T_R} f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr \right]$$

assumption

$$\Rightarrow \Phi(y) \geq \liminf_{R \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \Phi(Y_{T_R}) + \int_0^{T_R} f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr \right]$$
$$\geq \mathbb{E}_y \left[ g(Y_{T_0}) \mathbb{1}_{T_0 < \infty} + \int_0^{T_0} f(Y_r, u(Y_r)) dr \right] = J^u(y)$$

Assumption  
incl (1.4)

In the second case all inequalities become identities □

Intuition:...

⑧ The HJB equations provide conditions which allow to guess and verify. But they are only for Markov controls. The next Theorem says that this is not too restrictive.

Thm 2.3

$$\Phi_M(y) = \sup \{ J^u(y) : u \in \mathcal{A}_M \} \quad \mathcal{A}_M = \text{Markov controls}$$

$$\Phi_a(y) = \sup \{ J^u(y) : u \in \mathcal{A}_G \} \quad \mathcal{A}_G = \text{all allowed controls}$$

Suppose there exists an optimal Markov control  $u_0$ , i.e.  $\Phi_M(y) = J^{u_0}(y) \forall y \in G$ , such that all boundary points of  $G$  are regular w.r.t.  $(\dot{y}_t^0)$  and that  $\Phi_M$  is a bounded function in  $C^2(G) \cap C(\bar{G})$  with

$$E_y [ |\Phi_M(Y_\alpha)| + \int_0^\alpha |L^u \Phi_M(Y_t)| dt ] < \infty$$

$\forall$  bounded stopping times  $\alpha \leq T_G$ , all admissible controls  $u$  and all  $y \in G$ .

Then

$$\Phi_M(y) = \Phi_a(y) \quad \forall y \in G.$$

Proof

Let  $\Phi$  be a bounded fctn in  $C^2(G) \cap C(\bar{G})$  with

$$E_y [ |\Phi(Y_\alpha)| + \int_0^\alpha |L^u \Phi(Y_t)| dt ] < \infty$$

for all bounded stopping times  $\alpha \leq T_G$ , admissible controls  $u$  and all  $y \in G$ .

Moreover, assume

$$f(y, v) + (L^v \Phi)(y) \leq 0 \quad \forall y \in G, v \in U$$

$$\text{and } \Phi(y) = g(y) \quad \forall y \in \bar{G}.$$

Notice that  $\Phi_M$  satisfies these conditions by HJB and the assumptions.

Let  $y$  be the Hô process associated to an admissible control  $\tilde{u}$ .

Then Dynkin's formula yields

$$E_y [ \Phi(Y_{T_2}) ] = \Phi(y) + E_y [ \int_0^{T_2} (L^{\tilde{u}} \Phi)(Y_t) dt ]$$

$$\stackrel{\text{assumption}}{\leq} \Phi(y) + E_y [ \int_0^{T_2} f(Y_t, \tilde{u}_t) dt ]$$

$$\Rightarrow \Phi(y) \geq \limsup_{R \rightarrow \infty} E_y [ \Phi(Y_{T_2}) + \int_0^{T_2} f(Y_t, \tilde{u}_t) dt ]$$

$$\stackrel{\Phi \text{ bounded}}{=} E_y [ \Phi(Y_{T_G}) + \int_0^{T_G} f(Y_t, \tilde{u}_t) dt ] = J^{\tilde{u}}(y). \quad \text{choosing } \Phi = \Phi_M.$$



Remark

We can apply the theory to the minimum problem

$$\begin{aligned} \underline{V}(y) &= \inf_{u \in \mathcal{A}} J^u(y) = - \sup_{u \in \mathcal{A}} - J^u(y) \\ &= - \sup_{u \in \mathcal{A}} \mathbb{E}_y \left[ \int_0^{T_0} -f(Y_t, \tilde{u}_t) dt - g(Y_{T_0}) \mathbb{1}_{T_0 < \infty} \right] \end{aligned}$$

$\Rightarrow -\underline{V}(y)$  is the optimal performance function for profit rate function  $-f$  and loss function  $-g$ .  
The HJB eq turns into

$$\inf_{v \in U} \{ f(y, v) + L^v \underline{V}(y) \} = 0 \quad \forall y \in G$$

Example

Recall from the first lecture

$$X_t = x + \int_0^t (1 - u_s) ds + \int_0^t \sigma dB_s \quad m = n = 1$$

$$\Rightarrow b(r, x, u) = 1 - u \quad \sigma(r, x, u) = \sigma, \quad u = [0, 1]$$

$$L^u \Phi(y) = \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial s}(y) + (1 - u) \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial x}(y) + \frac{1}{2} \sigma^2 \frac{\partial^2 \Phi}{\partial x^2}$$

$$J^u(x, s) = \mathbb{E}_{x, s} \left[ \int_s^{\hat{T}_0} e^{-rt} u_t dt \right]$$

$$\Rightarrow f(y, u) = e^{-rs} u \quad g = 0$$

$$G = \mathbb{R} \times (0, \infty) \quad \hat{T}_0 = \text{the first time of bankruptcy}$$

HJB eq:

$$\Rightarrow f(y, v) + L^v \Phi(y) = e^{-rs} v + \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial s}(y) + (1 - v) \frac{\partial \Phi}{\partial x} + \frac{1}{2} \sigma^2 \frac{\partial^2 \Phi}{\partial x^2}$$

what leads to the same eq as we solved in the example there  $\leadsto$  eq (3).

